

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2
Draft: November 13, 2024

1 Introduction

In June 2023, the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) issued a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) for the Central Business District (CBD) Tolling Program. The FONSI was based on the April 2023 Final Environmental Assessment (EA), with committed mitigation.

At that time, seven tolling scenarios were presented in the Final EA and FONSI representing a range of toll structures to evaluate their ability to meet the needs of the Project and the resultant environmental effects. The Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) Reform and Traffic Mobility Act (the Act) requires that a Traffic Mobility Review Board (TMRB) be established to recommend a toll structure to the Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority (TBTA) Board, in order for the TBTA Board to thereafter propose and adopt a toll structure. Accordingly, the seven tolling scenarios were developed with various assumptions regarding toll rates, peak periods, and potential discounts, exemptions, and crossing credits, in order to disclose and analyze the range of effects that could occur as a result of the CBD Tolling Program. Recognizing that the TMRB could recommend a different toll structure than the scenarios studied in the EA, and that the TBTA Board could choose to adopt a different toll structure, the FONSI contemplated a reevaluation, prepared pursuant to 23 CFR § 771, once the TBTA Board adopted the CBD Tolling Program toll structure.¹

In November 2023, the TMRB issued a report detailing its tolling recommendations. The TBTA Board authorized the TMRB's tolling recommendations to be filed in the form of a proposed toll structure, and held a public comment period that included four public hearings. On March 27, 2024, the TBTA Board voted to adopt a final schedule of toll rates as well as associated exemptions, crossing credits, and discounts, referred to in this reevaluation as the "March 2024 adopted toll structure."

The March 2024 adopted toll structure was reevaluated to determine if the FONSI was still valid, as provided under 23 CFR § 771. In a letter dated June 14, 2024, FHWA concluded that the analysis conducted in the reevaluation (the June 2024 Reevaluation) confirmed that the March 2024 adopted toll structure and impacts associated with it were analyzed and mitigated appropriately under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), that no additional environmental analysis was warranted, and that the conclusions in the EA and the FONSI remained valid.

Before a tolling agreement under the Value Pricing Pilot Program (VPPP) was executed between FHWA and the Project Sponsors (TBTA, the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), and the New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT)) allowing for the CBD Tolling Program to be implemented, Governor Kathy Hochul announced that the Program would be temporarily paused, citing concerns over the cost of the toll to drivers.

In November 2024, the Project Sponsors wrote to FHWA proposing that the March 2024 adopted toll structure be implemented through a phase-in over six years (the "Phase-In Approach"). Under the Phase-In Approach, the Program would be implemented in three steps, culminating with the March 2024 adopted toll structure. The interim steps would have tolls for each vehicle class and time of day, as well as credits, proportionally reduced from the corresponding values in the March

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

2024 adopted toll structure. The proportional reductions would result in values for Phase 1 (2025, 2026, and 2027) equaling 60% of the corresponding values for the March 2024 adopted toll structure. For Phase 2 (2028, 2029 and 2030), the tolls and credits would equal 80% of the corresponding March 2024 adopted toll structure values. The March 2024 adopted toll structure would come into full effect in 2031. Notwithstanding the phasing in of tolls, the Project Sponsors would comply with all of the mitigation commitments set forth in the EA and FONSI within the same timeframes as contemplated in those documents and the reevaluation prepared for the March 2024 adopted toll structure.

This document reevaluates the CBD Tolling Program under the Phase-In Approach to determine if the FONSI is still valid.

2 Project Description

Under the Phase-In Approach, all features of the March 2024 adopted toll structure as described fully in the June 2024 reevaluation would remain. The only difference would be proportional reductions in all toll rates and credits for the first six years of implementation. This would include the tolls imposed on taxis and for hire vehicles (FHV), which unlike other tolls, would be charged to passengers for each ride occurring wholly or partially within the Manhattan CBD. Because the per-ride tolls would be phased in proportionally, in Phases 1 and 2, tolls applying to the average number of CBD rides for each type of vehicle (12 for taxis, 6 for FHVs) would sum to one single full price toll at the corresponding passenger car rate for that phase, thus achieving the FONSI's requirement to avoid disproportionately high and adverse effects on the population comprising taxi and FHV drivers.

The detailed toll schedules for Phases 1, 2 and 3 are shown below in Figure 1.

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE AND TUNNEL AUTHORITY CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT (CBD) CHARGES						
A E-ZPass Customers	VEHICLE CLASSIFICATION	PHASE 1		PHASE 2		PHASE 3
		CBD ENTRY CHARGE	TUNNEL CROSSING CREDIT	CBD ENTRY CHARGE	TUNNEL CROSSING CREDIT	CBD ENTRY CHARGE
1	Passenger and other vehicles, including sedans, sport utility vehicles, station wagons, hearse, limousines, pickup trucks with factory beds, pickup trucks with caps below the roofline and not extending over the sides, and vans without an extended roof above the windshield Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period for registered Low-Income Discount Plan participants using an eligible Peak period per-trip credit (maximum daily credit \$5.00) If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$9.00 \$4.50 \$2.25	\$12.00 \$6.00 \$3.00 \$1.50 \$3.00	\$15.00 \$7.50 \$4.00 \$2.00 \$3.75		
2	Single-unit trucks, including non-articulated trucks, pickup trucks with modified beds, vans with modified body behind the drivers cab, pickup trucks with caps above the roofline or extending over the sides, and vans with an extended roof above the windshield Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period per-trip credit If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$14.40 \$3.60	\$19.20 \$7.20 \$3.60 \$4.80	\$24.00 \$9.60 \$4.80 \$6.00		\$12.00 \$6.00
3	Multi-unit trucks, including articulated trucks where a power unit is carrying one or more trailers Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period per-trip credit If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$21.60 \$5.40	\$28.80 \$12.00 \$6.00 \$7.20	\$36.00 \$16.00 \$8.00 \$9.00		\$20.00 \$10.00
4	Buses, including vehicles registered with the DMV and plated as a bus, omnibus, or have other designated official plates Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period per-trip credit If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends) Licensed sightseeing buses Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period per-trip credit If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$14.40 \$3.60 \$21.60 \$5.40	\$19.20 \$7.20 \$3.60 \$4.80 \$28.80 \$12.00 \$6.00 \$7.20	\$24.00 \$9.60 \$4.80 \$6.00 \$36.00 \$16.00 \$8.00 \$9.00		\$12.00 \$6.00 \$20.00 \$10.00
5	Motorcycles Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Peak period per-trip credit If entering the CBD via the Lincoln Tunnel or Holland Tunnel If entering or exiting the CBD via the Queens-Midtown Tunnel or Hugh L. Carey Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$4.50 \$1.05	\$6.00 \$1.50 \$0.75 \$1.40	\$7.50 \$2.00 \$1.00 \$1.75		\$2.50 \$1.25
E-ZPass CBD entry charges are available subject to terms, conditions, and agreements established by the Authority.						
The Authority reserves the right to determine whether any vehicle is of unusual or unconventional design, weight, or construction and therefore not within any of the listed categories. The Authority also reserves the right to determine the CBD charge for any such vehicle of unusual or unconventional design, weight, or construction. Any single unit vehicle identified as belonging to Classes 1, 2, or 5 will be up-classed to the next toll class when towing a trailer or another vehicle.						
Daily toll cap of once per day for Class 1 and Class 5 vehicles. Caps for other vehicles are subject to change pursuant to the adaptive management approach to mitigating project effects, as committed to in the Final Environmental Assessment.						
CBD entry charges and tunnel credits are subject to a variable percentage increase/decrease of up to 10% for up to one year after implementation pursuant to the adaptive management approach to mitigating project effects, as committed to in the Final Environmental Assessment.						
The Low-Income Discount Plan shall continue for five years as committed to in the Final Environmental Assessment.						
The Authority reserves the right to charge a 25% higher CBD charge during Gridlock Alert Days. Each year, the NYCDOT identifies Gridlock Alert Days during the UN General Assembly and throughout the holiday season when heavy traffic is expected in Manhattan. On Gridlock Alert Days, consider walking, biking, or taking mass transit for any trips in Manhattan.						
Qualifying authorized emergency vehicles and qualifying vehicles transporting persons with disabilities are exempt pursuant to Vehicle and Traffic Law § 1704-a (2).						
Qualifying authorized commuter buses and specialized government vehicles, as determined by the Authority, are exempt.						

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE AND TUNNEL AUTHORITY CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT (CBD) CHARGES							
B	Customers Using Fare Media Other Than E-ZPass	PHASE 1		PHASE 2		PHASE 3	
		CBD ENTRY CHARGE	PER TRIP CHARGE PLAN*	CBD ENTRY CHARGE	PER TRIP CHARGE PLAN*	CBD ENTRY CHARGE	PER TRIP CHARGE PLAN*
1	Passenger and other vehicles, including sedans, sport utility vehicles, station wagons, hearses, limousines, pickup trucks with factory beds, pickup trucks with caps below the roofline and not extending over the sides, and vans without an extended roof above the windshield Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$13.50 \$3.30		\$18.00 \$4.40		\$22.50 \$5.50	
2	Single-unit trucks, including non-articulated trucks, pickup trucks with modified beds, vans with modified body behind the drivers cab, pickup trucks with caps above the roofline or extending over the sides, and vans with an extended roof above the windshield Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$21.60 \$5.40		\$28.80 \$7.20		\$36.00 \$9.00	
3	Multi-unit trucks, including articulated trucks where a power unit is carrying one or more trailers Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$32.40 \$8.10		\$43.20 \$10.80		\$54.00 \$13.50	
4	Buses, including vehicles registered with the DMV and plated as a bus, omnibus, or have other designated official plates Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends) Licensed sightseeing buses Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends)	\$21.60 \$5.40		\$28.80 \$7.20		\$36.00 \$9.00	
5	Motorcycles Peak period (5am-9pm weekdays, 9am-9pm weekends) Overnight period (9pm-5am weekdays, 9pm-9am weekends) NYC TLC taxis, green cabs, for-hire vehicles (FHV) Taxis, green cabs, and FHV on trips FHV on trips dispatched by high-volume for-hire services (HVFS)	\$6.75 \$1.65		\$9.00 \$2.20		\$11.25 \$2.75	
			\$0.75 \$1.50		\$1.00 \$2.00		\$1.25 \$2.50
<p><i>The Authority reserves the right to determine whether any vehicle is of unusual or unconventional design, weight, or construction and therefore not within any of the listed categories. The Authority also reserves the right to determine the CBD charge for any such vehicle of unusual or unconventional design, weight, or construction. Any single unit vehicle identified as belonging to Classes 1, 2, or 5 will be up-classed to the next toll class when towing a trailer or another vehicle.</i></p> <p><i>Daily toll cap of once per day for Class 1 and Class 5 vehicles. Caps for non-passenger vehicles are subject to change pursuant to the adaptive management approach to mitigating project effects, as committed to in the Final Environmental Assessment.</i></p> <p><i>NYC TLC taxi, green cab, and FHV tolls are to be paid by the passenger pursuant to Rules of City of NY Taxi & Limousine Commn (35 RCNY) §§ 58-26 (f), 59A-23 (b), 59D-17 (c).</i></p> <p><i>CBD entry charges and per trip charges are subject to a variable percentage increase/decrease of up to 10% for up to one year after implementation pursuant to the adaptive management approach to mitigating project effects, as committed to in the Final Environmental Assessment.</i></p> <p><i>The Authority reserves the right to charge a 25% higher CBD charge during Gridlock Alert Days. Each year, the NYCDOT identifies Gridlock Alert Days during the UN General Assembly and throughout the holiday season when heavy traffic is expected in Manhattan. On Gridlock Alert Days, consider walking, biking, or taking mass transit for any trips in Manhattan.</i></p> <p><i>Qualifying authorized emergency vehicles and qualifying vehicles transporting persons with disabilities are exempt pursuant to Vehicle and Traffic Law § 1704-a (2).</i></p> <p><i>Qualifying authorized commuter buses and specialized government vehicles, as determined by the Authority, are exempt.</i></p>							
<p><i>*Subject to full execution of and in compliance with plan agreement by FHV bases and taxi technology system providers.</i></p>							

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2
Draft: November 13, 2024

Table 2.1 – Tolling Scenarios Evaluated in the Final EA with the Phase-In Approach.

Tolling Scenarios Evaluated in the Final EA with the Adopted Toll Structure Added														
PARAMETER	TIME PERIODS	SCENARIO A		SCENARIO B		SCENARIO C		SCENARIO D		SCENARIO E	SCENARIO F	SCENARIO G		
		Base Plan	Base Plan with Caps and Exemptions	Base Plan with Caps and Exemptions	Low Crossing Credits for Vehicles Using Tunnels to Access the CBD, with Some Caps and Exemptions	Base Plan with Some Caps and Exemptions	High Crossing Credits for Vehicles Using Tunnels to Access the CBD, with Some Caps and Exemptions	Base Plan with Some Caps and Exemptions	High Crossing Credits for Vehicles Using Tunnels to Access the CBD, with Some Caps and Exemptions	Base Plan with Same Tolls for All Vehicle Classes	ADOPTED TOLL STRUCTURE - Phase-in Approach	ADOPTED TOLL STRUCTURE - Phase-in Approach	EXPLANATION OF HOW THE ADOPTED TOLL STRUCTURE IS WITHIN THE FINAL EA TOLLING SCENARIOS	
Peak: Weekdays	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	6 AM - 8 PM	Overnight period is the same length as those modeled in the Final EA, exceeding the commitment in the Final EA to reduce further reduced overnight tolls... format least 12:00 a.m. to 4:00 a.m. by charging overnight tolls between 5 a.m. to 5:45 a.m., by reducing a reduction in number of free periods for ease of customer understanding	
Peak: Weekends	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	10 AM - 10 PM	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Off Peak: Weekdays	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	8 PM - 10 PM	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Overnight: Weekdays	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	10 PM - 6 AM	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Overnight: Weekends	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	10 PM - 10 AM	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
POTENTIAL CROSSING CREDITS													Same as Final EA tolling scenarios	
Credit Toward CBD Toll for Tolls Paid at Bridge to Manhattan	No	No	No	Yes - Low	Yes - High	Yes - High	Yes - High	Yes - High	No	No	Yes - Low	No	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Credit Toward CBD Toll for Tolls Paid at Bridge to Manhattan	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
POTENTIAL EXEMPTIONS AND LIMITS (CAPS) ON NUMBER OF TOLLS PER DAY ¹⁴⁸													Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Auto, motorcycle, and commercial vans	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Once per day	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Taxis	No cap	No cap	Exempt	No cap	No cap	Exempt	Exempt	Exempt	Exempt	No cap	No cap	No cap	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
FHVs	No cap	No cap	Once per day	Three times per day	No cap	Three times per day	Three times per day	Three times per day	Three times per day	No cap	No cap	No cap	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Small and large trucks	No cap	No cap	Exempt	No cap	No cap	No cap	No cap	No cap	Exempt	No cap	No cap	No cap	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	
Business	No cap	No cap	Exempt	No cap	No cap	No cap	No cap	No cap	Exempt	No cap	No cap	No cap	Same as Tolling Scenarios C, D, E, and F	

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

PARAMETER	SCENARIO A	SCENARIO B	SCENARIO C	SCENARIO D	SCENARIO E	SCENARIO F	SCENARIO G	EXPLANATION OF HOW THE ADOPTED TOLL STRUCTURE FITS WITHIN THE FINAL EA TOLLING SCENARIOS	
								Base Plan with Caps and Exemptions	Base Plan with All Vehicle Classes
Approximate Toll Rate Assumed for Autos, Commercial Vans, and Motorcycles³									
Peak	\$9	\$10	\$11	\$14	\$19	\$23	\$23	\$12	\$12, \$15
Off-Peak	\$7	\$8	\$11	\$14	\$17	\$17	\$17	\$9	Within the range of \$9 - \$23
Overnight	\$5	\$5	\$7	\$10	\$12	\$12	\$12	\$7	Lower than range in the Final EA; closest to Tolling Scenarios A and B at \$5, exceed commitment in the Final EA (note: further reduced overnight tolls at or below 50 percent... by reducing peak toll by 75 percent)
Approximate Toll Rate Assumed for Trucks (Small Trucks/Large Trucks)⁴									
Peak	\$18 / \$28	\$20 / \$30	\$28 / \$42	\$38 / \$57	\$48 / \$69	\$65 / \$82	\$65 / \$82	\$12 / \$12	\$14.40 / \$19.20, \$24 / \$21.60, \$28 / \$36
Off-Peak	\$14 / \$21	\$15 / \$23	\$21 / \$32	\$29 / \$43	\$32 / \$45	\$49 / \$62	\$49 / \$62	\$9 / \$9	Within the range of \$14 - \$65 (small trucks) / \$12 - \$22 (large trucks)
Overnight	\$9 / \$14	\$10 / \$15	\$14 / \$21	\$19 / \$29	\$23 / \$35	\$33 / \$41	\$33 / \$41	\$7 / \$7	Tolls lower than range of rates presented in the Final EA, exceed commitment in the Final EA to include "other reduced overnight tolls at or below 50 percent... by reducing peak toll by 75 percent"

Notes:

1. Tolls would be higher during peak periods when traffic is greatest. All Final EA tolling scenarios and the adopted toll structure include a higher toll on designated "Gridlock Alert" days, although the modeling conducted for the Project does not reflect this higher toll since it considers typical days rather than days with unusually high traffic levels.
2. The adopted toll structure has a simplified two-time-period structure (i.e., peak and overnight) on weekdays, as opposed to the three-time-period (i.e., peak, off-peak, and overnight) weekday structures studied in the Final EA. As there is no longer an off-peak period on weekdays, the weekday peak and overnight periods are longer than those studied in the Final EA. The transportation modeling conducted for the adopted toll structure accounts for this change in the peak and off-peak structures studied in the peak and off-peak periods and thus the model results reflect this change.

3. Toll rates are for vehicles using E-ZPass and are rounded. For all tolling scenarios, different rates would apply for vehicles not using E-ZPass.
4. The Final EA provides information on the types of vehicles licensed by the New York City Tax and Limousine Commission (TLC) in Chapter 6, "Economic Conditions." Section 6.3.2.6, on page 6-32. These include yellow cabs, which are street-hailing cabs that begin their trips outside the core service area of Manhattan, and FHVs, which provide pre-arranged service, vehicles licensed as on-call service, vehicles licensed as high-volume FHVs, which provide high-volume for-hire services (page 6-32). Currently, there are two TLC-licensed high-volume FHVs: Lyft and Uber. In this reevaluation document and the Final EA, the term "taxi" is used to refer to yellow cabs, green cabs, and FHVs that are not high-volume FHVs and the term "FHV" refers to app-based, high-volume FHVs (i.e., Lyft and Uber).

5. The per trip tolls for taxis and FHVs in the adopted toll structure would be equivalent to the auto peak rate of \$15 (based on NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission analysis of trips made by TLC-licensed vehicles in May 2023) for taxis, the average number of trips with passengers (from within the CBD is 12, and for FHVs it is 6).
6. With the adopted toll structure, qualifying authorized emergency vehicles and qualifying vehicles transporting people with disabilities would be exempt from the toll. Specialized government vehicles would also be exempt. School buses contracted with the NYC Department of Education, commuter vans licensed with the NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission, and buses providing scheduled commuter services open to the public would also be exempt from the toll.

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

Table 2.2 – Modified Final EA Table ES-3. Comparison of Evaluation Results for the No Action and CBD Tolling Alternatives – with the Phase-in Approach.

SCREENING CRITERION	CBD TOLLING (ACTION) ALTERNATIVE FINAL EA SCENARIOS	PHASE-IN TOLL – PHASE 1 (\$9 PEAK AUTO TOLL)	PHASE-IN TOLL – PHASE 2 (\$12 PEAK AUTO TOLL)	PHASE 3 – 2024 ADOPTED TOLL STRUCTURE (\$15 PEAK AUTO TOLL)
Purpose and Need: Reduce traffic congestion in the Manhattan CBD in a manner that will generate revenue for future transportation improvements	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS
Objective 1: Reduce daily vehicle-miles traveled (VMT) within the Manhattan CBD Criterion: Reduce by 5% (relative to No Action)	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS
Daily VMT reduction (2023)	7.1% - 9.2%	6.4%	7.6%	8.9%
Objective 2: Reduce the number of vehicles entering the Manhattan CBD daily Criterion: Reduce by 10% (relative to No Action)	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS
Daily vehicle reduction (2023)	15.4% - 19.9%	13.4%	15.5%	17.3%
Objective 3: Create a funding source for capital improvements and generate sufficient annual net revenues to fund \$15 billion for capital projects for MTA's Capital Program	MEETS ¹		MEETS ²	
Net revenue to support MTA's Capital Program	\$1.0 billion - \$1.5 billion	\$0.5 billion	\$0.7 billion	\$0.9 billion
Objective 4: Establish a tolling program consistent with the purposes underlying the New York State legislation entitled the "MTA Reform and Traffic Mobility Act"	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS	MEETS

Notes:

1 As Final EA Tolling Scenario B would not meet Objective 3 with the toll rates identified and assessed in the Final EA, additional analysis was conducted to demonstrate that it would meet this objective with a higher toll rate; the resulting VMT reduction and revenue for that modified scenario would fall within the range of the other Final EA scenarios.

2 The net revenue needed to fund \$15 billion depends on a number of economic factors, including but not limited to interest rates and term. For the purposes of the Final EA, the modeling assumed the Project should provide at least \$1 billion annually in total net revenue, which would be invested directly into projects or bonded to generate sufficient funds. The net revenue values provided in this table are rounded and based on Project modeling. Following completion of the Final EA, based on current interest rates and expected timing of projects, MTA's Chief Financial Officer (CFO) determined that annual net revenues in the range of \$0.9 billion should be sufficient to meet the Project's need to fund \$15 billion of capital projects for the MTA Capital Program. For this reevaluation, MTA's CFO has determined that the expected revenues to be collected under the Phase-In Approach would in combination still achieve the objective of funding \$15 billion in capital projects to allow their completion on the same timeline as projected for the March 2024 Adopted Toll Structure.

The Phase-In Approach would achieve the congestion reduction objectives of the CBD Tolling Program of reducing vehicle miles travelled (VMT) within and the number of vehicles entering the CBD of 5% and 10%, respectively. Phases 1 and 2 would not raise as much annual revenue as the tolling scenarios studied in the EA or the March 2024 adopted tolling scenario (Phase 3). However, over time, the Program would still meet the Act's mandate to raise sufficient revenues to fund \$15 billion for capital projects for the MTA Capital Program. The Project Sponsors have reached a consensus that an incremental start would have the benefit of helping drivers adapt more easily to the Program, while monitoring data regarding implementation and effects. For example, drivers would have the time to adjust transportation modes, and continued improvements to mass transit – partly funded by revenues derived from the initial phases of the Program – would incentivize drivers to switch from autos to transit as the toll increased. The Project Sponsors have determined that these benefits outweigh more immediate revenues.

Central Business District Tolling Program: Re-evaluation 2

Draft: November 13, 2024

Therefore, the Phase-In Approach would meet the purpose and need of the CBD Tolling Program as described in the EA: to reduce traffic congestion in the Manhattan CBD in a manner that will generate revenue for future transportation improvements, pursuant to acceptance into the VPPP.

3 Evaluation of Continued Validity of FONSI

The June 2024 reevaluation comprehensively evaluated the effects of the March 2024 adopted toll structure and determined that for the effects identified, the mitigation set forth in the EA and FONSI would be sufficient to avoid significant effects. It also set forth an allocation of funding and a plan for developing and implementing place-based mitigation for environmental justice communities where diversions would cause truck traffic increases.

Under the Phase-In approach, the March 2024 toll structure would fully come into effect in 2031. During Phases 1 and 2, the structure would be the same but the tolls would be lower (but within the range of scenarios analyzed in the EA), to enable drivers to adjust their budgets and travel modes in a more graduated fashion. While some effects of the interim phases would by definition be reduced as compared to Phase 3 (such as effects on low-income drivers), the mitigation set forth in the EA and the June 2024 reevaluation would be implemented as previously contemplated – and would not be deferred until the March 2024 toll structure is fully implemented.

The analysis of various tolling scenarios in the EA and the June 2024 reevaluation indicates that as the implementation progresses through each phase, the effects of the CBD Tolling Program may have minor variations but would be within the range of effects studied in the EA and the June 2024 reevaluation because the Phase 1 and 2 peak tolling rates would fall within the ranges studied in the Final EA. By Phase 3, the effects would be those identified for the March 2024 adopted toll structure in the June 2024 reevaluation. Moreover, the traffic and air quality monitoring commitments set forth in the EA and FONSI would be implemented throughout this time period, as well as adaptive management if unexpected adverse effects are revealed through monitoring (as contemplated in those documents).

In conclusion, all NEPA requirements have been met and the mitigation measures identified in the EA and the FONSI are still applicable and will ensure that the Phase-In Approach, like the March 2024 adopted toll structure, does not result in significant effects.